***Motions 269 to 275.***

The following motions were not moved :—

MR. N. RAMAKRISHNA PILLAI :

269. To omit the allotment of Rs. 4,200 for experimental tannery.

MR. TARIATU KUNJITOMMAN :

270. To omit the allotment of Rs. 4,200 for experimental tannery.

MR. N. KUMARAN :

271. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 4,200 for experimental tannery Rs. 100.

MR. N. KUMARAN :

272. To omit the allotment of Rs. 1,750 for purchase of apparatus.

MR. M. R. MADHAVA VARIAR :

273. To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1·29 lakhs under Demand XIV by Rs. 100.

MR. N. KUMARAN :

274. To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1·29 lakhs under Demand XIV by Rs. 100.

MR. M. N. PILLAI :

275. To reduce the total allotment of Rs. 1·29 lakhs under Demand XIV by Rs. 100.

PRESIDENT : I now put to the vote of the House Demand XIV—Industries—Rs. 1·29 lakhs *minus* Rs. 9,000. I take it that the House accepts it.

The grant was made.

---

## DEMAND XV—MEDICAL DEPARTMENT.

MRS. MARY POONEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge*) : Sir, I beg to move for a grant not exceeding Rs. 5·40 lakhs under Demand XV—Medical Department.

***Motions 276 and 277.***

The following motions were not moved :—

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI :

276. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,200 for travelling allowances by Rs. 200.

MR. V. KUNJUKRISHNA PILLAI ;

277. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,200 for travelling allowances by Rs. 200.

***Motion 278.***

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Eraniel* cum *Vilavankod*) : Sir, I beg to move the following motion :—

*278. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 8,743 for Darbar Physician by Rs. 100.*

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Eraniel* cum *Vilavankod*) : ഈ പ്രമേയത്തെപ്പറ്റി എന്തെങ്കിലും പറയുന്നതിനു മുൻപ് ഇപ്പോൾ നിയമിച്ചിരിക്കുന്ന ഡർബാർഫിസിഷ്യനെപ്പറ്റി രണ്ടു വാക്കു പറയേണ്ടത് എന്റെ കടമയാണെന്നു ഞാൻ വിചാരിക്കുന്നു. ഇവിടെയെന്നല്ല ഇൻഡ്യ

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. T. Kumara Pillai.]

യിൽ എവിടെയെങ്കിലും സ്ത്രീവർഗ്ഗത്തിൽപ്പെട്ട ഒരു ദേഹത്തിനു ഡർബാർ ഫിസിഷ്യനാകാൻ ഇടയായിട്ടുണ്ടെന്നു തോന്നുന്നില്ല. ഇവിടത്തെ നിയമനിർമ്മാണസഭയിൽ സ്ത്രീകൾക്കു സാമാജികസ്ഥാനാർത്ഥിനികളായി നില്ക്കാമെന്നു നിയമം അനുവദിച്ചിട്ടുണ്ടെങ്കിലും അതിലേക്കാരും ഇതുവരെ തയ്യാറായിട്ടില്ല. എന്നാൽ നമ്മുടെ നിയമത്തിൽ അന്തർഭവിച്ചിട്ടുള്ള ആ മഹത്തായ ഉദ്ദേശത്തിന് ഈ നിയമനത്താൽ ഫലപ്രാപ്തി സിദ്ധിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു. നിയമസഭയിൽ ഒരു മഹതിക്ക് ആദ്യമായി മെംബർസ്ഥാനം കിട്ടാൻ ഇടയായതു തിരുവിതാംകൂറിലാണെന്നുള്ള സംഗതി നമുക്കെല്ലാവർക്കും അഭിമാനകരമായിട്ടുള്ള ഒന്നാണെന്നു പറയേണ്ടതില്ലല്ലോ.

രാജ്യത്തിന്റെ ജനസംഖ്യ വർദ്ധിക്കുംതോറും ജനങ്ങൾക്ക് ഏറ്റവും അത്യാവശ്യമായിത്തീർന്നിട്ടുള്ള വൈദ്യസഹായം അതിലേക്കനുരൂപമായ വിധം വർദ്ധിച്ചുവരുന്നില്ലെന്നുള്ള സംഗതിയെ കൌൺസിലിന്റെ ശ്രദ്ധയിൽ കൊണ്ടുവരുന്നതിനുവേണ്ടിയാണ് ഈ മോഷൺ കൊണ്ടുവന്നിട്ടുള്ളത്.

ബറോഡാരാജ്യത്തിൽ ൨൫ ലക്ഷം ജനങ്ങളുടെ ആവശ്യത്തിന് ആശുപത്രികളും ഡിസ്പെൻസറികളുമായി ൪൫ എണ്ണമുണ്ടെന്നാണ് അവിടത്തെ രാജ്യഭരണറിപ്പോർട്ടിൽനിന്നു കാണുന്നത്. അവിടത്തെ മെഡിക്കൽഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിനു ൧൮-൧൯-ൽ ൨൯ ലക്ഷം രൂപാ ചിലവാക്കിവന്നിരുന്നത് ൧൯൨൩-ൽ എത്തിയപ്പോൾ ൩൯ ലക്ഷം രൂപയായി വർദ്ധിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു. അവിടത്തെ ഗവർണ്മെൻറ് അതുകൊണ്ടും തൃപ്തിപ്പെടാതെ ആശുപത്രികളെ കൊണ്ടുള്ള പ്രയോജനം ജനങ്ങൾക്കു കൂടുതലായി ലഭിക്കുന്നതിനുവേണ്ടി പലേ പരിഷ്കാരങ്ങളോടുകൂടിയ ഒരു പുതിയ സ്കീം ഇപ്പോൾ അനുവദിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു. ആ സ്കീം അനുസരിച്ചു ഗ്രാമനിവാസികൾക്ക് അഞ്ചു മൈലിനകം വൈദ്യസഹായം കിട്ടത്തക്കവണ്ണം ഡിസ്പെൻസറികൾ തുറക്കാനാണ് നിശ്ചയിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളത്. ഇവിടെ ൧൯൦൦-ൽ ആശുപത്രികളും ഡിസ്പെൻസറികളുമായി ൪൩ എണ്ണം ഉണ്ടായിരുന്നതിനു ൪, ൪൯൯ രൂപാ ചിലവാക്കിയിരിക്കുന്നു. ൧൯൨൫-ൽ എത്തിയപ്പോൾ ആശുപത്രികളുടേയും ഡിസ്പെൻസറികളുടേയും എണ്ണം ൭൦ ആയി വർദ്ധിക്കുകയും അതിലേക്ക് ൭, ൬൩, ൫൩൫ രൂപാ ചിലവാക്കുകയും ചെയ്തിരിക്കുന്നു. ൨൫ വർഷങ്ങൾകൊണ്ടു ൪ ആശുപത്രികളും അതിന്റെ ചിലവിൽ ൨, ൧൬, ൯൫ രൂപായും വർദ്ധിച്ചിരിക്കുന്നു. ബറോഡാരാജ്യത്തെ ൨൫ ലക്ഷം ജനങ്ങൾക്ക് ഉപകരിക്കുന്നതിനു ൪൫ ആശുപത്രികൾ ഉണ്ടായിരിക്കയും അതിലേക്ക് ൩൯

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

ലക്ഷം രൂപാ ചിലവാക്കി വരികയും ചെയ്യുന്നു. ഇവിടത്തെ സ്ഥിതി യോ ൪൦ ലക്ഷം ജനങ്ങളുടെ ആവശ്യത്തിന് ൨൨ ആശുപത്രികളും ഉണ്ടായിരിക്കയും അതിലേക്ക ൩ ലക്ഷത്തോളം രൂപാ ചിലവാക്കിവരികയും ചെയ്യുന്നു. ഇവിടത്തെ മെഡിക്കൽ ഡിപ്പാർട്ടുമെൻറിൽ ചിലവാക്കിവരുന്ന ൩ ലക്ഷത്തോളം രൂപായ്ക്കുതുല്യമായ ഫണം ജനങ്ങൾക്കു സിദ്ധിച്ചുവരുന്നില്ലെന്നുള്ള ജനങ്ങളുടെ മനോവേദന ഓരോ ദിവസവും വർദ്ധിച്ചു വരികയാണ് ചെയ്യുന്നതു. ഇവിടെയുള്ള ആശുപത്രികളെ ജനങ്ങൾക്കു കൂടുതൽ പ്രയോജനകരമാക്കി തീർക്കുന്നതിനും, കൂടുതൽ ആശുപത്രികൾ സ്ഥാപിക്കുന്നതിനും വേണ്ടി ഗവർമ്മെൻറു വേണ്ട നിഷ്കൃഷ്ടി ചെയ്യേണ്ടതാണ്. ആശുപത്രികളെ ജനങ്ങൾക്കു കൂടുതൽ പ്രയോജനകരമാക്കി തീർക്കുന്നതിനും കൂടുതൽ ആശുപത്രികൾ സ്ഥാപിക്കുന്നതിനും പണമില്ലെന്നുള്ള സമാധാനം പറയുമായിരിക്കാം. ഒരു രാജ്യത്തിന്റെ വരവിൽനിന്നു ചിലവാക്കുന്ന സംഗതിയിൽ ഒന്നാമത്തെ സ്ഥാനത്തു നില്ക്കേണ്ടതു ജനങ്ങളുടെ ആരോഗ്യരക്ഷയ്ക്കു വേണ്ടിട്ടുള്ള ചിലവാണെന്നുള്ളതിൽ ആർക്കും അഭിപ്രായവ്യത്യാസം വരാൻ തരമില്ലാത്തതാണ്.

കുഴിത്തുറയിൽ ഒരു സർക്കാർ ആശുപത്രിവേണമെന്ന് അവിടത്തെ ജനങ്ങൾ എത്രയോ കാലമായി സങ്കടം പറഞ്ഞു കൊണ്ടിരിക്കുന്നു. അവിടെ ഒരു മിഷൻ ആശുപത്രിയുണ്ടെന്നുള്ള കാരണത്താലാണ് അവർക്കു സർക്കാർ ആശുപത്രി കൊടുക്കാതിരിക്കുന്നതു. അവിടെ ഒരു മിഷൻ ആശുപത്രിയുണ്ടെന്നു ഞാൻ സമ്മതിക്കുന്നു. മിഷൻ ആശുപത്രിയിൽ നിന്നു ചികിത്സനടത്തി കിട്ടുന്നതിനുള്ള ചിലവുകളുടെ പരിമാണം ഗവർമ്മെൻറിന്റെ ശ്രദ്ധയിൽ എത്തിട്ടില്ലെന്നാണ് ഞാൻ കരുതുന്നതു്. സാധാരണജനങ്ങൾക്ക് അവിടെ ചികിത്സകൾ നടത്തിക്കാൻ അവരുടെ ധനാദായസ്ഥിതി അനുവദിക്കാതിരിക്കുന്നു. ഒരു രാജ്യത്തു പല ഭാഗത്തും നിവസിക്കുന്ന ജനങ്ങൾക്കു ധർമ്മമായി വൈദ്യസഹായം കിട്ടുമ്പോൾ വിളവംകോട്ടതാലൂക്കിലെ ജനങ്ങൾ മരുന്നുകൾ വിലയ്ക്കുവാങ്ങേണ്ടിവരികയും ചികിത്സയ്ക്കു പ്രതിഫലം കൊടുക്കേണ്ടിവരികയും ചെയ്യുന്നതു കഷ്ടമാണെന്നു പറയാതെ തരമില്ല. ഒരു സംഗതിയിൽ ഗവർമ്മെൻറിന്റെ ശ്രദ്ധ പതിയേണ്ടതായിരിക്കുന്നു.

ചികിത്സയ്ക്കു വിലപിടിച്ചതും നല്ലതുമായ മരുന്നുകൾക്കു പകരം ഫണം കുറഞ്ഞതും വിലകുറഞ്ഞതുമായ മരുന്നുകളെ ഉപയോഗിച്ചു വരുന്ന പതിവ് ഇനിയെങ്കിലും മാറ്റിവയ്ക്കേണ്ടതാണ്. ആശുപത്രികളിൽ ചില മരുന്നുകൾ തീർന്നുപോയാൽ പകരം വേറെ മരുന്നുകൾ ചേർത്തു

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. A. Hoogewerf.]

കൊടുക്കണമെന്നും ആ സംഗതി രോഗികളെ അറിയിക്കരുതെന്നും നിഷ്കർഷിച്ചിട്ടുള്ളതിനേയും ഭേദപ്പെടുത്തേണ്ടതാണ്.

ഓരോ അവയവങ്ങളെപ്പറ്റിയുള്ള പ്രത്യേകപഠിപ്പിനായി മെഡിക്കൽ ആഫീസറന്മാരെ വിദേശങ്ങളിൽ അയയ്ക്കുന്ന അവസരങ്ങളിൽ അതിലേയ്ക്കനുരൂപന്മാരേയും പ്രത്യേകം വാസനയുള്ളവരേയും തിരഞ്ഞെടുത്തു അയയ്ക്കുന്നതിൽ പ്രത്യേകം നിഷ്കർഷകം ഉണ്ടായിരിക്കേണ്ടതാണ്. സ്ത്രീകൾക്കായുള്ള കൊല്ലം വിക്ടോറിയാ ആശുപത്രിയിൽ പുരുഷന്മാരെ നിയമിക്കുന്നതുകൊണ്ടു സ്ത്രീകൾക്കുള്ള സുഖക്കേടുകളെ അവർക്കു തുറന്നു പറഞ്ഞു ചികിത്സിപ്പിക്കുന്നതിനു പ്രതിബന്ധമായി നില്ക്കുന്നതിനെ ഇനിമേലാലെങ്കിലും മാറ്റേണ്ടതാണ്.

MR. A. HOOGEWERF (*Nominated*): I join Mr. Kumara Pillai in voicing, if I may say so, the sentiments of this House and probably the sentiments of the whole country in the epoch-making event of appointing a lady as the head of the Medical Department and as a member of this Council. In the history of the legislatures in India, such an event has never taken place. It will be mentioned in red letters in the history of Travancore that it was the first State during the time of a Maha Rani and during the administration of the present Dewan that this glorious new departure took place. The joy is all the greater because Dr. Mary Lukose is a daughter of the soil and is the only daughter of the revered, highly honoured and highly loved doctor, the late Dr. Poonnen, who is still remembered with the greatest affection by the whole of Travancore. The appointment of a woman as the head of the Medical Department is quite in keeping with the present social and literary status of Travancore. We stand first in the whole of India in the matter of female education. The *karanavatti*, in the absence of a *karanavan*, a male member, becomes the head of the family. Similarly the senior member of the Medical Department, the *karanavatti*, I may say, has been rightly acknowledged to be the head of the medical family.

I have been a great and unsparing critic of the Medical Department, and I am extremely sorry that we have not had the privilege or occasion of wishing good-bye to Dr. Lakshmanan who went away from us under very sad circumstances, having received a telegram from Mrs. Peter Lakshmanan about her illness. We are extremely sorry in not having had occasion to say a word of good-bye or a word of praise to that eminent doctor. He has done a great deal of good to the country. I have been a critic of his administration, no doubt. But, there is not the smallest doubt that he was a great physician and a great doctor and that he has done many good things to the Department.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

I do not want just now to go into the details of the administration of the Medical Department. Nor do I think that it will be very necessary for saying much about the Medical Department hereafter. Knowing as I do Mrs. Poonnen Lukose, I have the greatest confidence in her and I hope that everything possible will be done by the Head of the Administration to enable her to improve the Department and to help the suffering people of Travancore.

MR. T. K. VELU PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Nedumangad*): Sir, the Medical Department has been stationary for some time. For very many years there have been various difficulties which we have been urging the Government to remove. The help that is given in the hospitals is not within the reach of the poor people. I have known instances in which poor in-patients had to tip peons and compounders. I was referring yesterday to the fact that one has to consult the auspicious stars before one takes medicine, because the medical officers themselves warn persons that if possible it would be better to buy medicines from chemists' shops.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): Will the member be pleased to say whether in-patients have not got to tip doctors in the Medical Department.

MR. T. K. VELU PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Nedumangad*): The fee that is paid to a doctor is not a tip; it is very much more than that.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): When they are in the hospital?

MR. T. K. VELU PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Nedumangad*): If the doctor goes out of the way and attends to the patient more than his duty in the Hospital requires, then the doctor may have to be paid and there is nothing immoral about it.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): What I mean to say is when the in-patients are in the Hospital.

MR. T. K. VELU PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Nedumangad*): I have said what I have to say. I wish to associate myself with Mr. Hoogewerf in saying that Doctor Lakshmanan was an eminent physician, was respected and loved in Travancore for very many years. He has now gone and let us wish well by him. The personality of the present head of the Medical Department, I do not want to draw into the vortex of controversy. I might say that the present head of the Medical Department is there, not because she is a woman, but because she is an efficient doctor with considerable administrative capacity. As a Hindu I believe in destiny. The good Doctor Poonnen was helping the people, rich and poor, young and old, and he had a fund of generosity which should be appreciated for all time. But because Doctor Poonnen was an Indian, he had no chance of becoming Darbar Physician and directing the Medical Department at that time. But the good that men do sometimes lives after them. I understand that it was Doctor Poonnen who suggested the idea of a large Maternity Hospital, I am told, he even planned the buildings. It is in the fitness of things in the dispensation of kind



LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mrs. Mary Poonnen Lukose.]

Providence that the daughter of that eminent doctor, who is herself a doctor of considerable experience and capacity, has been sent to us to continue the excellent work that her father did in the interests of the suffering people of Travancore. I trust that, under the present head of the Medical Department, there will be a real alleviation of distress in the land.

MR. J. JOHN NIDIRY (*Changanacherry* cum *Minachil*): I associate myself with the previous speakers in congratulating Mrs. Lukose on her appointment as the head of the Medical Department and also as a member of this Council. I also think that it is a matter for congratulation not only to that lady, but it is a matter for congratulation for ourselves as well as to our beloved country.

My friend Mr. Kumara Pillai has brought to the notice of the House one important fact with regard to the Medical Department, that is, the need for the extension of its usefulness still further. I fully agree with him in saying that the usefulness of the Medical Department requires still further extension and he has quoted one instance from South Travancore. I may quote many from North Travancore. But so far as my constituency is concerned, I may bring to the notice of the House the immediate necessity for having a hospital or a dispensary in the constituency which I have the honor to represent. Sir, in Changanachery and Minachil there are only two medical institutions, namely one at Lalam and another at Changanachery. But these two taluks cover a very large area.

MR. J. JOHN NIDIRY (*Changanacherry* cum *Minachil*): But the distances between Lalam, Changanachery, Kottayam, Vaikam and Muvattupuzha—these are the surrounding hospitals—are so great that the people inhabiting the middle portion of these taluks or *proverthies* do not get any medical aid from Government. I have come across many cases where patients die for want of facility to get any medical aid. In some urgent cases, such as confinement cases, it is very difficult to carry the patient to the distant hospitals and many cases of death have occurred. So what I bring to the notice of the new Darbar Physician and also to the Government and to the members of this House is the necessity for starting one hospital somewhere near the middle of these localities—say at Kuravilangad or Kozhai which is centrally situated.

MRS. MARY POONNEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge*): After the very kind references made to me, Sir, permit me, before I begin to answer Mr. Kumara Pillai's motion, to say a few words. I am very grateful to the members for giving me such a cordial reception. When I entered this House I came with the feeling very similar to that which I experienced about seventeen years ago when I entered His Highness the Maha Raja's College for Boys, as the first lady student. It was with that same nervousness and diffidence that I entered this House yesterday. This House has given me a reception which has encouraged me not a little. But still my position is a very peculiar one. I have been

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

suddenly called upon to fill an office of great responsibility and there is no gainsaying the fact that I must attempt it with very great fear and diffidence, especially when I think of the fact that till two days ago the place was filled by one of the ablest and most experienced officers of the State. I have been called upon in this session to answer questions relating to a department in which I have not got a very vast experience. All I can promise this House is that I will try my best to do my duty honestly and to the best of my ability during the short period granted to me. I may also say that I am not accustomed to the subtleties and 'niceties' of the legal mind and I do not know how my statements will be interpreted by those legal members. Therefore, I would request this House to make some indulgence if I am not able to answer all the questions satisfactorily. Mr. T. K. Velu Pillai sympathised with Mr. Stephenson's position. I feel, he must sympathise much more with mine.

MR. T. K. VELU PILLAI (*Trivandrum cum Nedumangad*): I do not sympathise because I am sure the present Darbar Physician will do her work with much ability. (*Laughter.*)

MRS. MARY POONNEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge*): What Mr. Velu Pillai said now has comforted me greatly. I feel that this House is a family of which the Head of the Medical Department is the elder sister. I say the elder sister, Sir, and you must pardon me for it, because I hope that in years to come younger sisters also may be born to this House. (Mr. A. Hoogewerf: *Hear, hear.*)

Coming to Mr. Kumara Pillai's motion, he pointed out the necessity for the extension of medical relief in the State and said that there should be more facilities for medical relief. He compared Travancore with Baroda and said that, having regard to the population of the State, medical relief in Travancore is not adequate. We must remember that we are spending on Vaidyasalas and Ayurvedic Institutions about one and a half lakhs of rupees annually and there are also many Mission Hospitals in the State. Of course in these Mission Hospitals, medicines have to be paid for. Still I only say that medical relief is available in all parts of the country. I may assure the House that I would do all in my power to consider the question and I am sure that Government also will do the same. (*Hear, hear.*)

I think Mr. M. N. Pillai pointed out that in-patients have to pay for their treatment in hospitals. I have heard of such cases too, Sir, but in all cases that have come to my notice, I have severely dealt with the offenders. I have been in charge of only one institution in the State and I cannot therefore now answer for the whole Department.

But dufing the short period I have been ordered to be in charge of this Department, I promise that I shall deal all such cases that come to my notice with the same strictness. (*Hear, hear.*)

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[President.]

As for the establishment of a hospital between Lalam and Changanachery I am not in a position to offer any remarks. But, as I said in the beginning, I shall try my best to extend medical relief wherever it is possible.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Eraniel cum Vilavankod*): I withdraw the motion.

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

***Motions 279 to 287.***

The following motions were not moved :—

MR. M. N. PILLAI :—

279. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 8,743 for Darbar Physician by Rs. 100.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI :—

280. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 13,500 for travelling allowance by Rs. 3,500.

MR. V. KUNJUKRISHNA PILLAI :—

281. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 1,86,300 for purchase of European medicines and surgical instruments by Rs. 26,300.

MR. V. KUNJUKRISHNA PILLAI :—

282. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 7,000 for bedding and clothing by Rs. 1,000.

MR. V. KUNJUKRISHNA PILLAI :—

283. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 3,000 for uniform for hospital staff by Rs. 1,000.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI :—

284. To omit the allotment of Rs. 1,200 for maintenance of X-ray engine and pumping plant.

MR. T. M. CHIDAMBARATANU PILLAI :—

285. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 3,008 for rents by Rs. 1,000.

MR. V. KUNJUKRISHNA PILLAI :—

286. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 28,602 for pay of menials by Rs. 1,602.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI :—

287. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 4,96,129 for Hospitals and Dispensaries by Rs. 100.

***Motion 288.***

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): I rise to move the following motion :—

*288. To reduce the allotment of Rs. 4,96,129 for Hospitals and Dispensaries by Rs. 100.*

My object in bringing this motion is to draw the attention of Government to the desirability of entrusting the administration of medical institutions within municipal limits, except in the capital, to Municipalities, of appointing honorary, surgeons in the important medical institutions and also of introducing the system of grant-in-aid to private medical practitioners.

PRESIDENT : That matter has been referred to the Darbar Physician and it is under the consideration of the Darbar Physician now.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): In view of that I am prepared to withdraw my motion.

PRESIDENT: What I mean to say is that the question of giving grant-in-aid to private practitioners has been referred to the Darbar Physician. The other points have not been referred to the Darbar Physician. You may say what you have got to say on them.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): With regard to the other two matters, I may say that it is one of the primary duties of Municipal Councils to give medical relief to the people within municipal limits. They should be made to contribute towards medical relief to the people in the town. In so far as education is concerned, Government are of opinion that the Municipalities should take up primary education within municipal limits.

MR. J. JOHN NIDIRY (*Changanachery* cum *Minachil*): May I know whether Mr. Sankara Menon thinks that our Municipalities have reached such a stage as to be fit enough to take charge of medical institutions.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): We are advancing. We want responsible government and therefore a training should be given in administrative matters, and if the experiment is successful it must be extended.

MR. T. K. VELU PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Nedumangad*): Is the hospital a democratic institution?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): What I say is—

MR. JOHN MACKIE (*Planters*): May I know whether he proposes to tax the people of the towns and put up another local hospital?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): Certainly, Government also must pay.

MR. JOHN MACKIE (*Planters*): Are the people to pay additional tax?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): The Municipality has to pay.

PRESIDENT: Is it your idea that the control of these hospitals and dispensaries within municipal limits should be transferred to Municipal Councils?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): Government should also give financial help.

PRESIDENT: Do you mean that these institutions should be transferred to the Municipalities and subsidised by the Government or that the Municipalities should run these institutions while they are maintained at the cost of the Government?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): Administration should be in the hands of the Municipality and the Government should subsidise.



LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[President.]

MR. V. SUBBA AIYAR (*Additional Head Sirkar Vakil*): May I know whether he has got an expert medical officer in the Municipal Council to supervise the work of the hospital?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): The local medical officer is an official member of the Council.

MR. V. SUBBA AIYAR (*Additional Head Sirkar Vakil*): Does he want him to supervise his own hospital?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): Such questions of detail will have to be considered later at the time of the consideration of the proposal.

MR. T. K. VELU PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Nedumangad*): Taking Quilon as an example, may I know whether Mr. Sankara Menon would desire that the chief medical officer of the Quilon hospital should be under the Municipality or under the Government?

PRESIDENT: He wants him to be under the Municipality, as far as I can see.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): The administration should be handed over to the Municipality.

MR. T. K. VELU PILLAI (*Trivandrum* cum *Nedumangad*): He is not to be in the general medical service of the State?

PRESIDENT: Services should be lent.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): May I know whether they propose to give medical aid free or on payment of fees?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): These are details which will have to be worked out and therefore I suggest that the opinion of the Municipal Councils on the point should be obtained and the matter considered by Government.

Another point is about the appointment of honorary surgeons. Now there is no lack of private medical practitioners and there would be persons willing to undertake honorary services.

PRESIDENT: Will they be willing to come and work *gratis*?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): Yes.

PRESIDENT: They are quite welcome to do it.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): They will be willing to take up work.

PRESIDENT: Provided they do not interfere with the discipline of the institution, they will be quite welcome, I think.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): That is being tried in Madras.

PRESIDENT: It is being tried in Madras to some extent. The Madras scheme proposes to subsidise private practitioners. At the time of war, a few private practitioners were enlisted as honorary workers, and that was, I believe, only for a very short period.

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): I know there were two honorary surgeons in the Royapuram hospital.

PRESIDENT: I do not think anybody would object to it.

MR. A. HOOGEWERF (*Nominated*): Will such doctors be willing to conduct surgical operations free of charge ?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): This will create healthy competition among medical men to the advantage of the people. Therefore a trial should be made in that matter. It is with that object that I have brought forward this motion.

MR. JOSEPH PANJIKARAN (*Shertallai*): I rise to oppose the motion. My friend was saying that the hospitals in Municipalities must be brought under municipal control and the finances for the same should come partly from the Municipality and partly from the Government. When such an item of expenditure is also added to the already existing municipal institutions, that would be additional taxation under the head of medical aid.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): To that extent expenses would also be reduced.

MR. JOSEPH PANJIKARAN (*Shertallai*): To what purpose that reduction in the budget should be utilised, my friend has not said. In my opinion such a scheme will be taken as another source of indirect taxation. We are having too many of them. The Village Panchayat will be coming down upon us like a falcon which will practically knock away a good portion of the earnings of the villagers and my friend wants to throw another burden on the Municipality which will insist on the municipal authorities imposing upon municipal residents, in some respect or other, fresh taxation on the ground of medical aid. On that ground I object.

Then again a very pertinent question was put by Mr. Nidiry at the time when Mr. Sankara Menon was moving his proposition, *viz.*, whether Municipalities at present can be trusted with the management of hospitals. With all respect to the Municipalities and for the persons concerned in the management of Municipalities, I for one think that they have not attained that stage at which we can entrust to them safely the hospitals of any particular town. On these grounds, I oppose the motion.

MR. A. HOOGEWERF (*Nominated*): I too oppose the motion. Mr. Sankara Menon has not given us any idea of the advantages to be gained by introducing this innovation. The Travancore Medical Department is being run on splendid lines. I do not know why new-fangled notions should come in here. (*Laughter.*) I do not speak from the financial aspect of the question alone, but from the people's aspect too. Simply because there have been some hospitals in some Municipalities, why should we go and imitate all these things? Let us imitate only what is really good and sound. There are a number of improvements to be made in other directions. I think the Municipalities ought to concentrate their attention on sanitation, the supply of good drinking water and so on. The Medical Department might be left

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mrs. Mary Poonnen Lukose.]

alone. We have a splendid staff of officers in the Department and it appears to the unnecessary to disturb the present state of affairs.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): May I know whether we have not got a splendid staff of officers in the Public Works Department and whether the roads are not being handed over by the Government to the charge of Municipalities?

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Eraniel* cum *Vilavankod*): Do the Government pay for the maintenance of these roads?

PRESIDENT: To whom are you putting the question? Mr. Hoogewerf is in possession of the House.

MR. T. KUMARA PILLAI (*Eraniel* cum *Vilavankod*): Excuse me. I beg your pardon.

MR. A. HOOGEWERF (*Nominated*): They are more than splendid. We want to make a deep cut in the P. W. Budget. (*Laughter.*) We want to twist their tail a bit when the time comes. That is not the point just now. If after twisting the tail they do not run properly, then it will be high time to see what should be done. There is a bright future for the Medical Department. We should not deviate from the present state of affairs. As I said before, a woman is in charge and it would be highly improper on our part to disturb the peace, equanimity and the smooth and correct running of the Department just now. For these reasons, I oppose the motion.

MR. J. JOHN NIDIRY (*Changanachery* cum *Minachil*): I am very sorry that I have to oppose the motion. Of course I am aware that this is a democratic age. We all love self-government and home rule and so forth. But the account which I have been able to gather as to the present working of some of the Municipalities is so discouraging that I think we should wait some time more to experiment upon such an important measure as handing over the Medical Department to such bodies. We are already complaining that our people are being heavily taxed and every day new sources of taxation are resorted to, and I am sure if such an experiment is tried, it is sure enough to be followed by additional taxation. Under these circumstances, I think we must wait for some time to come to experiment upon this.

MR. M. N. PILLAI (*Trivandrum*): I also oppose the motion on another ground. Even under efficient management, there is great scarcity of even ordinary drugs in the Government hospitals. Sometimes, even Epsom salt which is a necessary and very important drug for daily use is not available in the Government hospitals and I am sure under the Municipalities it will be worse. It can never be so efficient as under Government. And in addition to taxation, which they are sure to impose on the people, they may have to purchase drugs from the local chemists. On that ground, I oppose the motion.

MRS. MARY POONNEN LUKOSE (*Surgeon in charge*): Sir, the question raised by Mr. Sankara Menon is such a difficult one that I

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

do not feel I am in a position to say much about it. But, what I feel is a doubt whether the Municipalities will have sufficient money and will have the men necessary for running such an administration. I fear, human lives are far too precious to be entrusted or to be experimented upon in such a way. (*Laughter.*) Roads may be experimented upon, but not human lives (*laughter*) ; and unless I have more details regarding the proposition, I do not want to say anything further at present.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*) : A word in reply. The question of finance does not arise for consideration. Whether Municipalities should wholly finance the institutions or the Government should contribute wholly or in part are not relevant to the question.

PRESIDENT: Unless you want the Government to incur the whole cost as they do now, the Municipalities will have necessarily to find some portion at least of the funds required.

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): If the management of roads, sanitation of towns, and management of education are handed over to the Municipalities by making some contributions from the Government, I do not see how medical institutions stand on a different footing from those of the other duties of Municipalities. The giving of medical relief is a primary duty of the Municipality.

MR. V. SUBBA AIYAR (*Additional Head Sirkar Vakil*): Is it not a discretionary duty of the Municipality?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): It forms an optional duty, I know, under the Regulation.

MR. V. SUBBA AIYAR (*Additional Head Sirkar Vakil*): May I know whether any municipality has at least an Ayurvedic dispensary?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): There is a proposal and I believe they are considering the question. Some of the Municipalities at any rate are considering that question.

MR. A. HOOGEWERF (*Nominated*) : What is the advantage to be gained by this innovation? (*Laughter.*)

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): The advantage is that, as a body has been created for purposes of local administration, they should be entrusted with certain powers and that will give the people a training in local administration.

MR. A. HOOGEWERF (*Nominated*): Will there be no supervision by the Darbar Physician?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): It is a matter of detail.

MR. N. RAMAKRISHNA PILLAI (*Vaikam cum Ettumanur*) : Is it a question of unemployment?

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly

[Mr. C. Sankara Menon.]

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): It seems to me, Sir, that, if certain branches of administration could be handed over, I do not see why this also should not be handed over to the Municipalities.

PRESIDENT: Do you press your motion, Mr. Sankara Menon?

MR. C. SANKARA MENON (*Quilon*): I do not press the motion.

The motion was, by leave, withdrawn.

The Council adjourned at 5-15 P. M. to meet again at 11-30 A. M. the next day.

S. PARAMESVARA AIYAR,
*Secretary to the Legislative Council.*

LIBRARY ARCHIVES Kerala Legislative Assembly